

Review: [untitled]

Author(s): María Rosa Menocal

Source: *Hispanic Review*, Vol. 61, No. 1 (Winter, 1993), pp. 91-93

Published by: University of Pennsylvania Press

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/473291>

Accessed: 11/10/2010 11:48

---

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>. JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use provides, in part, that unless you have obtained prior permission, you may not download an entire issue of a journal or multiple copies of articles, and you may use content in the JSTOR archive only for your personal, non-commercial use.

Please contact the publisher regarding any further use of this work. Publisher contact information may be obtained at <http://www.jstor.org/action/showPublisher?publisherCode=upenn>.

Each copy of any part of a JSTOR transmission must contain the same copyright notice that appears on the screen or printed page of such transmission.

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



*University of Pennsylvania Press* is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Hispanic Review*.

The fact that these studies have been previously published should not deter anyone from reading this book. Bolinger originally intended this material (together with other material gathered over the years) to be published as a comparative grammar of English and Spanish, which, because of other commitments, never materialized. This book, however, is a nice approximation, though it is not intended by any means to be a complete grammar of the Spanish language.

What sets this book apart from those which are simply a compilation of previously published articles are the "Author's Notes" which preface the essays. Many of these notes inform the reader of the state of affairs (i.e., the various and often conflicting views) of a particular topic at the time of the original publication of the essay, thus providing the reader with a nice "historical" setting for each. Others introduce information or ideas which have occurred to Bolinger since the publication of a particular piece. Upon reading these notes, one will also discover that Bolinger was often ahead of his time in syntactic, semantic, and discourse theory, and was original in the use of certain linguistic terminology, though, more often than not, it was not his term which was to catch on. Nevertheless, and more important, most of (if not all of) Bolinger's views still stand firm to date, though he himself insists that many of the topics are still open to debate.

Bolinger's book could serve a wide audience. Advanced students and teachers could benefit from the raw material contained herein. Theoretical linguists, especially of a younger generation (e.g., many of these studies were published before this reviewer was even born), have at their disposal a nice selection of linguistic studies on the Spanish language which may serve as a point of departure for their own investigations. Administrators and directors of language programs who insist on some sort of "natural" or "direct" immersion-type approach of teaching will discover that "grammar" is not a bad word, and that teaching it in the classroom can actually *benefit* the students. And scholars who feel that teaching takes up too much of their time for research just might realize, by taking Bolinger's example, that the two activities need not be in a state of irreconcilable divorce.

JOEL RINI

*University of Virginia*

***Islamic Spain. 1250 to 1500.*** By L. P. Harvey. Chicago: U of Chicago P, 1991. 370 pages.

In the clarity of considerable hindsight, and certainly in the context of an understanding of the cultural complexities of medieval Spain, it is

obvious that the first of the four spectacularly transformational events of 1492, the signing of the final agreements of the capitulation of Granada on the 2nd of January, is the symbolic and pragmatic point of departure for the other three: the decree to expel the Jews, the publication of Nebrija's grammar of Castilian, and the day of Columbus' departure which, with kabbalistic precision, is the same second of August that is the last day for the Jews to leave the beloved homeland of Sefarad. But the capitulation of Granada itself is but the end of the complex chapter of Islamic Spain that is conveniently (if slightly imprecisely, as all such demarcations must be) seen as the period between the middle of the 13th century, when there is very substantial and diminished redrawing of the map of what had been al Andalus, and 1500, when, less than eight years after the decrees that had guaranteed the Granadan Muslims religious freedoms, it was all too clear that Islam would not, after all, have a place in the new Spain. Indeed, as L. P. Harvey puts it at the end of this remarkable new history of this last chapter of Islamic Spain, having just quoted a key passage on proclamations which forced conversions and consecrated mosques into churches, "Here then in 1499 is the effective end of Islam in Granada, at least of Islam as a public religion" (335).

In this quarter of a millennium most of the fundamental structures of Spain are reshaped dramatically and, no less, it is clear that the history of the 16th century, both political and perhaps especially literary, will be powerfully affected by the radical transformations figured in all these events. And yet, until now, one has had to clumsily piece together the parts of that earlier story. But Harvey's work, at once minutely detailed and impassioned, as the best history must always be, now lays it all out scrupulously, with every detail and every broad stroke. The standard cliché that it is impossible to do justice to a certain kind of book in a review of this scope is overwhelmingly accurate here: the labor of nearly a decade of sustained dedication yields 20 chapters that attempt the necessary and yet until now unattempted: the writing of a comprehensive history so that the many Muslims living in Christian kingdoms of Castile, Aragon and Navarre are integrated, as they were historically, to the fate of the politically independent Muslims of the Kingdom of Granada. And thus, by extension, all regions of Spain to each other. And from this integrated history, as well as Harvey's meticulous adherence to the principles of accessibility to non-specialists, of extensive citation of contemporary documents (in many cases translated for the first time) and to the multiple contexts, normally so falsely separated (the Christian sphere from the Muslim sphere, for example), what emerges is a detailed narrative of the transfigurations of history that never loses sight of the vast implications—in some cases for us, a half a millennium later—of what is happening, and even why.

Let me allow Harvey to speak for himself: in the context setting first chapter (16 pages that should be required reading for any Hispanist working in any period), after a brief and lucid discussion of the cluster of

political events that make 1250 the beginning of a very different era, he gives the reader a sense of the change at hand. “The existence side by side of three religious communities, which had been such a marked characteristic of Islamic Spain in the days of the Caliphate, was no feature of Islamic Granada in our period. . . . The Arabization of Granada at the end of the Middle Ages is not as strange a phenomenon as the readoption of Hebrew by Zionist Jews in Israel in the twentieth century, because Granada had already had the basis of Arabic existing there as a majority tongue. Nevertheless, the strength of the Arabic language there until the very end is indeed remarkable. There is no sign at all that Arabic in Granada was in any danger of being replaced by Castilian at any time before the military defeat of 1492. To be a Granadan implied a positive affirmation of identity: to dress, eat, sleep, wash, sing, pray, and be, in quite distinctive ways. *The new frontier drawn on the map at about 1250 became a frontier of the mind*” (14–15, emphasis mine). The intimacies between political frontiers and those of the mind are always Harvey’s concern and most of the rich citations from contemporary documents are both selected and framed to reveal just that.

While all medievalists will certainly need to read the complex and at times novelistic history of the more than two centuries that is covered in the next 17 chapters, the last two, “The Conquest of Granada (1490–1492)” and “All Mudejars Now: Islamic Spain (1492–1500)” constitute, like the first, ultimately essential reading for everyone. Clearly, and this brings me back to my observations at the outset about the crucial (and yet often ignored) ties among the events of 1492, no branch of Hispanism can afford to ill understand the tragic closures at hand, especially, those who might imagine themselves furthest removed, Latin Americanists and modernists of all stripes. In these final pages of Harvey’s often moving narration the drama of the capitulation emerges vividly, and we read many relevant (and often eye-opening) excerpts from Capitulations themselves. Indeed, Harvey, true to his method throughout, gives the last word to a contemporary, a Granadan, who ends a small sermon delivered just outside Granada, with questions about the future whose poignant answers we now know quite well: “If after such a short space of time it appears that we are having to struggle to survive, what will people do when the end of the season is upon us? If parents now make little of their religion, how are their great-great-grandchildren to exalt it? *If the King of the Conquest does not keep the faith, what are we to expect from his successors?*” (339) But although the story thus seems to end in the pathos of the prefigured tragedy, in 1499, Harvey’s own goal, stunningly executed throughout, was laid out nakedly at the beginning, in the closing words of his preface: “This study is not conceived as a study of failure, however, rather as a record of courageous and stubborn defense” (xi).

MARÍA ROSA MENOCAL

*Yale University*